

DRAFT
SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
December 20, 2023

A regular meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, December 20, 2023, at 6:00 pm. **VIRTUAL ZOOM MEETING.** Present were: Rebecca English, Vijay Joyce, Mark Meche, Milo Martinez, Larry Spang. Staff: Patti Kelleher. Not present: Kelly Tyler-Lewis, Mark Pattison.

15 Chestnut Street

Peter Gordon and Karen Hayes submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for new curbing

This application was reviewed under the minor change category. No abutter objection was received, and the certificate was issued. Therefore, the public hearing was cancelled.

Request to amend Certificate of Appropriateness for gutters - 3 Cambridge Street - continuation

Ms. Kelleher stated that she had not heard from the applicant. The Commission agreed to continue to the next meeting.

149 Federal Street – Request to amend certificate for trim color and building modifications – continuation

Kathy and Joesph Archambault submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for fencing

Kathy and Joesph Archambault were present to discuss the project.

Chair Spang noted that Mr. Joyce reviewed the paint colors in person. Ms. Kelleher noted that the body color was approved but not the trim color. Mr. Joyce noted that the applicant wanted to wait on the trim color until spring. He added that the body color looks great, and he found the proposed trim color appropriate, but he told the applicants that the Commission would need to approve it. He noted that a water table has been added along the rear, and along Flint and Federal Streets where there was none previously. The water table was finished in the same style as the house next door, also a Georgian gambrel. There was no immediate evidence that there was a water table, but it was also needed and not reviewed by the Commission. Ms. Kelleher clarified that tonight's review is for the paint color trim, Sherwin Williams - Cloud Nine, and the installation of the water table.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

VOTE: English made a motion to approve to the trim color Sherwin Williams - Cloud Nine and the installation of the water table. Meche seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

1 Pickering Street

Joseph Locke – Continued discussion on fence design

Ms. Kelleher stated that she had not heard from the applicant. Chair Spang noted that the applicant was given SHC recommendations and was asked to return. Ms. Kelleher agreed to follow up with the owner.

VOTE: Martinez made a motion to continue to the next regular meeting on January 3, 2023. Joyce seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

36 Derby Street– continuation

Stanley and Barbara Wrobel submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint color for trim and foundation (after the fact)

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 11/20/23
- Photographs

Stanley Wrobel was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Kelleher noted that the Commission members were asked to review the paint colors on their own prior to this meeting.

Chair Spang noted that the Commission had concerns with the bright white color and foundation. Ms. English noted that the white was too white when compared to the neighboring cream color and the window trim was stark white and the creamy white seems more appropriate. Mr. Meche agreed with Ms. English, noting that the foundation isn't a great color choice, but it will not take long to fade. Mr. Joyce agreed with English and Meche, noting that he was less concerned with the foundation color and more concerned with the white.

Chair Spang asked if the windows were painted wood. Mr. Wrobel replied yes. Chair Spang asked if the gutter was white aluminum. Mr. Wrobel replied yes. Chair Spang stated that the downspouts looked like they were painted to match. Mr. Wrobel replied yes, they were painted the same as the base color, white at the gutter and grey to match the body. Chair Spang noted that the contemporary white is stark white while historic whites are less bright and that is the concern. He asked about painting the trim a softer white or off-white. Mr. Wrobel replied that he would rather not spend the money to do so but he's willing to do it. He noted that 81 Derby Street has a similar body and trim color, so he is surprised to hear a suggestion to paint his.

Mr. Meche noted that the Commission approved a rear stair with painted lattice, and he asked if it was repainted. Mr. Wrobel replied no, the paint color was matched. Mr. Kelleher noted that the previous application paint color language stated that the stairs were "to be painted white." Chair Spang noted that Intex product can be painted. Mr. Kelleher noted that it was required on a Cambridge Street application but not the previous application for this property. Ms. English questioned if that occurred before the house was painted. Chair Spang noted that they have no record of painting the porch. Mr. Joyce asked if they repainted the windows before the porch. Mr. Wrobel believed so. Ms. Kelleher noted that the old porch wasn't painted with the previous work.

Chair Spang stated that the Commission was not interested in approving the brighter white, but a new creamier paint color can be proposed. Mr. Meche added that this being missed by the Commission is unfortunate and puts the Commission in an awkward position. He suggested taking the "in-kind" off a new approval until a future application since it was missed. Ms. Kelleher noted that City staff tries to figure out the specifics and tie it to a paint color name and staff will look through the files to do so the next time an application is submitted.

Mr. Meche stated that the existing white is too bright. Mr. Joyce agreed. Ms. English suggested not letting this go even though it was a replacement in-kind noting that it could continue what has been an administrative challenge. Chair Spang stated that the 81 Derby Street application was a new house overlooking the park, which may have

been overlooked because the new composite windows were bright white. Mr. Martinez stated that the order of operations is unfortunate, noting that when the body color changed from yellow to blue it should have been approved. Chair Spang noted that there was much conversation about the porch, but two wrongs don't make a right, although he is sympathetic. Mr. Martinez noted that it was painted white by the time the Commission approved the new stair rail and if it was caught, they would have requested a color change since the house was painted without Commission approval.

Chair Spang suggested a continuance so the applicant can propose a new paint color for a deputized Commission member to review without needing another meeting. Ms. English suggested approving the foundation color that won't change. Ms. Kelleher replied that the body color was previously approved.

VOTE: Martinez made a motion to approve body color as painted, to amend the trim color including segments of the porch painted to match the trim, and for a creamy white color to be finalized by Martinez, and be painted by the end of April 2024. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

11 Lynn Street– continuation

Lynn Street Home Trust submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows and door

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/24/23
- Photographs

Kurtis Tanguay (Sales Manager) was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Kelleher stated that the sample window is at the Planning Department office. Mr. Meche and Mr. Joyce stated that they had seen the window. Mr. Meche looked up the source KHH Windows and Doors, which resembles other products that the Commission has not been satisfied with. The brochure did show a window section with some detail but no typical architectural details showing how it would fit into the window opening. It also has a lot of profile and may not meet Commission standards. He questioned whether it would be custom sized to fit the opening, or the closest size would be used regardless of the existing opening size. Mr. Martinez noted that the window has mitered composite corners to disqualify other proposed windows, and he doesn't believe it's a good source for historic replacement windows. Mr. Joyce agreed with Mr. Meche and Mr. Martinez, noted that the mitered corners and thick frame been seen before and would need significant alteration. Mr. Meche suggested that other products from the line could work, noting the windows used at the new building across from Mercy Tavern look good and could be used in this instance.

Mr. Tanguay stated that his company sells custom sized vinyl windows with thicker frames filled with spray foam. He questioned the Commission's concerns with the mitered corners which are stronger, also noting that fastened windows can have fasteners that back themselves out. Chair Spang replied that they lacked the historic look, the Commission wants an appropriate look for the historic house. The Commission doesn't recommend brands but can provide a list of previously approved windows. Mr. Tanguay noted that contractors sometimes select a window based on what the customer can spend. The existing windows are in rough shape, but they can match simulated divided lites, grid, with custom sizing to within 1/8 of an inch; however, the miter can't be changed.

Ms. Kelleher noted that the Meridian line from KHPP. Chair Spang noted that they can add a mullion on the exterior and interior, so it appears to be true divided. Mr. Meche asked if the window was new construction. Mr. Tanguay replied that they have a nail fin to eliminate glass loss. Mr. Meche stated that the Commission must follow guidelines regarding new windows in a frame opening. The Commission would want to see cross sections to know the details of the window placement, and to confirm its final effect. Chair Spang asked if the interior and exterior muntins match the existing window, noting that the Commission doesn't approve exterior applied only. Mr. Tanguay replied that they can move trim, noted that the middle spacer isn't efficient since it is conductive and more details can be provided.

Chair Spang noted the lack of support from the Commission for the proposed replacement window. Mr. Meche suggested a continuance. Mr. Joyce asked whether a window with details that are a close match to the historic character of the existing window and the neighborhood was available, that follows the Design Guidelines and to replicate the details of the existing window. Chair Spang questioned whether the window had been installed in other historic districts with details that are similar to historic windows, and whether the window sits within the opening and not out in front of the opening because of the nail stop. Ms. Kelleher agreed to provide a window replacement worksheet for the applicant.

VOTE: Joyce made a motion to continue to the January 3, 2024 meeting. Meche seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

174 Essex Street

Mitchell Blum submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for aluminum gutters

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 11/18/23
- Photographs

Ms. Kelleher stated that the application was not advertised correctly and will be heard at next meeting.

10 Broad Street

Brett McCarty submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for building modifications and door color

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 12/4/23
- Photographs

Brett McCarty was present to discuss the project.

Ms. McCarty stated that the old oil-based steam system was replaced. She would like to receive approval for air conditioning condensers. There would be a separate mini-split system for the third floor and the installer has determined an interior path to run the lines. She would also like to add a front gutter on the left side in two pieces because of the different rooflines which may require two downspouts. She proposed a purple door by C2 or whatever purple color the Commission would approve. She would also like to add a rear door to the garden, approximately aligned with the second window from the right. The higher ceilings on the right-side addition that created the higher roofline, that she would like to mirror. The A/C condenser and mini split would be located along the rear corner along Cambridge Street and suggested adding arborvitaes at the rear corner to help conceal the units

from the road. A larger electrical meter is needed to handle the upgrades. To properly vent the heating system flu, a vent was added on the Cambridge Street side, which can be painted to match. Lastly, there are storm windows in the basement that were removed when the house was painted, that she would like to reinstall and paint to match.

Chair Spang questioned whether the rear door was visible. Ms. McCarty replied that the new door would align with the edge of the small window above. Bill Peterson will create the drawings and it will include adding a stained glass sidelite next to the rear door. Mr. Meche and Mr. Joyce suggested a site visit. Ms. McCarty noted that she will determine a proposed paint color. Ms. Kelleher noted that it would be helpful to see how the modifications at the garden would affect the view. Chair Spang stated that they will need more information on the proposed electric meter including shut-off's, dimension, installation height, clearances, etc.

Ms. McCarty proposed C2 paint colors "Scooter" and "Mystery" and agreed to provide samples that are complimentary to the blue-gray color of the house. Mr. Joyce asked if the Commission had previously approved purple. Ms. McCarty noted that there are purple doors in the neighborhood.

Mr. Joyce requested timelines on each item. Ms. McCarty replied that she needs approval on the condensers soon because there is no heat on the first floor, the entry doors can be painted when there are a couple warm days, gutters can wait for the weather to be safer, or when the Commission deems it appropriate, but she wants to do the work as swiftly as possible.

Mr. Meche asked what piece of equipment had been installed. Ms. McCarty replied the black flu for two gas furnaces, one in the basement to heat the first floor, and one in the attic to heat the second floor. The condenser for the third-floor unit will be small, and there is one for each HVAC system. Ms. Kelleher asked if the 2 square condensers and 1 mini split will sit on stands. Ms. McCarty replied yes, the mini splits are efficient at first but then they run a long time and the boiler has already been installed.

VOTE: Joyce made a motion to continue to the next meeting for a site visit. Martinez seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Ms. McCarty asked if the flu can be painted the house color. Chair Spang replied yes, but she should check with the manufacturer to make sure it doesn't require a special type of paint.

18½ Pickman Street

Steven Arias and Matthew Malone submitted a Waiver of the Demolition Delay Ordinance to demolish more than 50% of roof

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 12/4/23
- Photographs

Ryan McShera of Red Barn Architecture was present to discuss the project.

Mr. McShera stated that the single family Four Square house was built between 1840 and 1850. The owners want to finish the third floor and add more space. There is an existing hip roof that they are proposing to remove, but will maintain the pitch and ridge height, and add a gable to make it usable. No stair access accommodation will be

necessary. They will keep the front pediment triangle and trim at eave line in place and will construct new roof to meet the existing trim. There will be a demolition of more than 50% of roof requiring Commission review. Chair Spang noted that this property is not in the district but is subject to the demolition delay ordinance. Ms. Kelleher noted that the building is listed as a contributing resource in a National Register Historic District.

Mr. Joyce asked if the rake trim and scalloped shingles would be replicated. Mr. McShera replied yes, they will keep the lower shingles, but the owner wanted to differentiate them. Mr. Joyce noted that not changing roofline pitch is good. Mr. Meche asked if the walls of third floor are coplanar with second floor. Mr. McShera replied yes. Mr. Meche asked if the projections are sloped up to match up with the roof line and the proposed material. Mr. McShera replied yes, architectural shingles.

Chair Spang believed the structure to be historically significant and preferably preserved. He asked if the chimney was centered. Mr. McShera responded yes, they are proposing to demolish it to open the floor space, and no new chimney is proposed. Mr. Meche asked if the demolition delay does not apply to chimneys. Chair Spang replied correct, the Commission has no say over the removal of chimneys.

Mr. Meche asked how much full-height space will be gained, noting that the windows look small. Mr. McShera replied that this floor will house a full master bedroom suite and working with the outside architecture means there will be sloped ceilings. Mr. Meche suggested including floor plans for clarity.

Public Comment:

Ms. Kelleher received the following public comment letter that she read into the record: Historic Salem, Inc., dated October 4, 2023, recommended that a demolition delay waiver be granted.

Joyce Kenney. Believed this property is in the state registry of historic homes, believed a state approval may be necessary, and was in support of the proposal. Chair Spang replied that a state approval was not required as a private residence would not use state funds.

No one else in the assembly wished to speak.

VOTE: Joyce made a motion to find the property historically significant. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Chair Spang suggested maintaining the front hipped roof. Mr. Meche proposed allowing a gable. Chair Spang agreed that the proposal looked appropriate.

VOTE: Joyce made a motion to not find the house preferably preserved based on the architectural drawings by Red Barn Architecture dated November 11, 2023, thereby waiving the demolition delay. English seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

52 Forrester Street

Circle Hill Builders LLC submitted a Waiver of the Demolition Delay Ordinance to demolish garage

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 12/5/23
- Photographs

Attorney Bill Quinn and Matt Carlson (Architect) were present to discuss the project.

Atty. Quinn stated that this is an existing single-family home, and the developer wants to add a second structure making it a two-family home. They still need to meet with ZBA but there was a lack of a quorum at their last meeting. There is no historical significance to the removal of the garage that would allow the construction of the second structure and provide outdoor parking. The age of the garage is undetermined, but the home was built in the 1800's, so it is assumed that the garage is over 50-years of age.

Ms. Kelleher stated that the home was constructed in 1898, and the 1998 inventory form mentions the early 20th century garage on the property. In 1998, the garage had its original doors and was surrounded by landscape and vegetation. Mr. Joyce noted that currently only one set of the doors remains. Mr. Meche noted that the doors are rotting due to neglect.

Chair Spang asked if less than 50% of the house roof was being demolished. Mr. Carlson approximated 25%. Chair Spang noted that with less than 50% of roof removed, the Commission could request documentation that calculates the percentage of roof to add to the file that includes dimensions. Ms. Kelleher noted that the Commission has never encountered a request for percentage of roof.

Public Comment:

Joyce Kenney. Agreed that the garage should be demolished and supported the proposed waiver of the demolition delay.

No one else in the assembly wished to speak.

VOTE: Joyce made a motion to find the garage historically significant. Meche seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez - no, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

VOTE: English made a motion to waive the demolition delay for the purpose of demolishing the garage. Joyce seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

Chair Spang advocated for the new construction looking like it is a part of the district, but suggested it look as though it fits even more, despite the Commission not having jurisdiction.

384 Essex Street

DRR Real Estate Trust submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for electrical meter

Ms. Kelleher stated that this was an emergency approval so the applicant could have heat in the building. It was waived so the Commission does not need to review it.

Other Business:

a. Meeting Minutes;

VOTE: English made a motion to approve the September 20, 2023 regular meeting minutes with her edits. Joyce seconded. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

b. Other:

Ms. Kelleher stated that the City Council held all reappointments and it may be on their early January agenda. Any Commission member can continue to serve until reappointed or someone else can take over. She noted that Mr. Joyce is up for reappointment, one public member opposed his reappointment, but the Council and Mayor can reappoint someone as they see fit. Ms. Kelleher noted that she is waiting for an application for a new member to fill the currently vacant alternate space. The Commission currently has 6 active members, and 1 alternate, noting that Mr. Pattison hasn't been able to join to due health concerns and his term expires June of 2024.

Ms. English stated that there appears to be on-going work at the property previously proposed for demolition on Webb Street. Ms. Kelleher replied that there is no active approval for demolition since the waiver request was withdrawn. Chair Spang noted the removal of windows, added reinforcement, and the presence of a lift on site. He suggested speaking to the Building Inspector. Ms. Kelleher read a review of proposed items. Mr. Martinez noted that the property has a new owner as of 1-month ago.

Ms. Kelleher stated that the roof shingle option proposal for minor change will be added to the January 3, 2024 meeting agenda.

Adjournment

VOTE: English made a motion to adjourn. Martinez seconded the motion. Roll Call: Joyce, English, Martinez, Meche and Spang were in favor and the motion so carried.

The meeting ended at 8:40PM

Respectfully submitted,

Colleen Brewster
Historical Commission Clerk